STATE OF TEXAS COUNTY OF TARRANT CITY OF GRAPEVINE

The Historic Preservation Commission for the City of Grapevine, Texas met in Public Hearing on Wednesday, February 22, 2017 at 6:00 p.m. in the Grapevine City Hall, 2nd Floor Council Chambers, 200 South Main Street, Grapevine, Texas, with the following members present to wit:

Sean Shope R. Lee Derr Ashley Anderson Margaret Telford Ted Ware

Chairman
Vice Chairman
Commissioner
Commissioner
Commissioner
Commissioner

Eric Gilliland

Alternate Commissioner

Paul Slechta Monica Hotelling

Chuck Voelker

City Council Liaison

Planning & Zoning Liaison

The above commissioners constituted a quorum with Commissioner Vick Cox absent.

With the following city staff present:

Matthew Boyle

City Attorney, City of Grapevine

Paul W. McCallum

Executive Director, Grapevine Convention & Visitors Bureau

Paula Newman
David Klempin

Director of Operations

David Klempin Mary Bush Historic Preservation Officer
Historic Preservation Secretary

With Grapevine Heritage Foundation Liaison Janet Perkins and Lisa DuPlessie of 527 South Dooley Street as a citizen present.

CALL TO ORDER AND WELCOME

Chairman Sean Shope called the Public Hearing to order at 6:00 p.m. He welcomed all attending and thanked City Council Liaison Paul Slechta, Executive Director Paul W. McCallum, Planning & Zoning Liaison Monica Hotelling for their participation and service to the Commission.

CITIZEN COMMENTS

There were no citizen comments.

Any person who is not scheduled on the agenda may address the Historic Preservation Commission under Citizen Comments by completing a Citizen Appearance Request form. In accordance with the Texas Open Meetings Act, February 22, 2017 HPC\Minutes\2017

the Commission is restricted in discussing or taking action during Citizen Comments.

WORK SESSION

Staff Approved Certificates of Appropriateness as follows:

```
#CA17-05 for property located at 821 East Worth Street;
#CA17-06 for property located at 210 West Wall Street;
#CA17-08 for property located at 517 East Worth Street;
#CA17-09 for property located at 813 East Wall Street;
#CA17-10 for property located at 814 South Main Street;
#CA17-11 for property located at 401 West College Street;
#CA17-13 for property located at 814 South Main Street;
#CA17-14 for property located at 421 South Main Street;
#CA17-15 for property located at 846 East Wall Street;
#CA17-16 for property located at 129 South Main Street, Suite# 210;
#CA17-17 for property located at 807 East Texas Street;
#CA17-18 for property located at 852 East Texas Street;
#CA17-20 for property located at 846 East Wall Street;
#CA17-21 for property located at 709 South Main Street.
```

PUBLIC HEARING

Chairman Shope opened the **Public Hearing for #CA17-07** for the property located at 221 West College Street, legally described as Block 14 Lot:N167.5'W81 ½'3, College Heights Addition, Grapevine, Texas and take any necessary action.

Chairman Shope called on David Klempin to present the case.

BACKGROUND:

Certificate of Appropriateness application #CA17-07 was submitted by the applicant, Neal Cooper, on January 17, 2017 to renovate the existing house, construct new rooms in the second floor attic space with a new dormer, and construct a new 1½ story addition on the rear of the house; to construct a new two-car detached garage and relocate the existing storage shed to the rear corner of the property. The house is a contributing structure to the College Street Residential Historic District. It was originally built in 1888 and has an addition constructed in 1910. The Queen-Anne style house shows influence of the renowned Texas architectural firm Sanguinet and Staats of Fort Worth. The house features a large dormer with curved sides, located above the main entry, which recalls the Benjamin Richard Wall House at 421 Smith Street attributed to the Sanguinet and Staats firm.

The plans for the house renovation, new additions and garage were developed by Architect Russell Moran following the Design Guidelines established for the property and the provisions of the 2013 update to the Preservation Ordinance. Plans call for February 22, 2017 HPC\Minutes\2017

reconstructing the missing chimney on the east elevation; original details of the house would be replicated in the new additions. The original house contained 1,628 square feet of living area. The existing house with new additions would total 2,959 square feet of living area; the new 500 square feet garage and the 173 square feet storage shed would bring the total for all structures to 3,632 square feet. The site is 11,690 square feet in size with building coverage of 31%, coming in under the allowed maximum coverage of 40%.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommended the Historic Preservation Commission <u>approve with conditions</u> Certificate of Appropriateness #CA17-07 for the property located at 221 West College Street, legally described as Block 14, Lot N167.5'W81 ½'3, Grapevine, City of, Grapevine, Texas to the Grapevine Historic Preservation Ordinance 91-73 (Appendix G – Grapevine Code of Ordinances), as amended for the following items:

- 1. to renovate the existing house, construct new rooms in the second floor attic space with a new dormer, and to construct a new 1 ½ story addition on the rear of house;
- 2. construct a new two-car detached garage; and
- 3. relocate the existing storage shed to the rear corner of property;

as per attached plans following the Design Guidelines established for the property located within the College Street Residential Historic District; with the conditions a building permit is obtained from the Building Department and all exterior materials, windows, doors and door hardware, light fixtures and paint colors be approved under a separate Certificate(s) of Appropriateness.

Chairman Shope called on the applicant, Neal Cooper of Copper Street Homes, to present his case. Mr. Cooper thanked staff for help on the project and said the main floor of four rooms would stay near the same but would need a staircase worked in. He would get the fireplace back in and the storage shed would become a garden potting shed.

Vice Chairman R. Lee Derr asked David Klempin for the required black and white photographs documenting the now existing property. David Klempin said he had photographs and will have black and white photographs presented for each case as the commission moves forward.

Commissioner Margaret Telford confirmed the entry to the garage would be from Church Street and asked how far to the rear of the property. Mr. Cooper answered approximately 40 feet; Chairman Shope was concerned if years from now the property would not work because of the distance of the garage from entering the house. Mr. Cooper responded he and the homeowners had strong discussion on this, they felt if the garage was nearer the house it would isolate the backyard. They had agreed the distance to the garage was worth having a backyard near the house.

Margaret Telford made the motion to close the public hearing for #CA17-07; Ashley Anderson seconded the motion which prevailed in the following vote:

Ayes: 7 (Shope, Derr, Anderson, Gilliland, Telford, Voelker and Ware)

Absent: 1 (Cox) Nays: None

Chairman Shope called for any other comments; there were none.

Ted Ware made the motion to approve **#CA17-07** with the conditions as presented; Ashley Anderson seconded the motion which prevailed in the following vote:

Ayes: 7 (Shope, Derr, Anderson, Gilliland, Telford, Voelker and Ware)

Absent: 1 (Cox) Nays: None

PUBLIC HEARING

Commission to hold a public hearing relative to a proposed checklist form to be completed for all Certificate of Appropriateness applications heard before the Grapevine Historic Preservation Commission and take any necessary action.

Chairman Shope called on David Klempin to present.

BACKGROUND

The checklist was developed to supply the information the commissioners requested at the November and December 2016 meetings, such as total square feet of lot and the ratio of the total proposed square feet of a structure to the size of the property. Historic Preservation staff told the commission these numbers would be presented at all future meetings. Each blank on the checklist has, in parenthesis, the parameters available as per the 2013-23 Ordinance. This checklist would be included in the agenda packet, making these numbers available to commissioners for their review, as they prepare for the public hearing.

The current three-page Certificate of Appropriateness application form has been in use since 1995 and has worked well.

Recently, Historic Preservation staff have been asked by the Commission for information not supplied by the above document. A checklist is needed to provide the details required for review by the Commission. The checklist would provide more information at hand for decision making by the Commissioners at the meetings. It incorporates the Commission's input received by staff at the January 25, 2017 meeting. Adding the proposed checklist would be a step forward, providing the Commission with the answers to commonly asked questions and it would serve as an aid to preventing cases from being "tabled", the applicant being delayed for another month, and having to return before the Commission.

City Attorney Matthew Boyle suggested a check box be added to the Certificate of Appropriateness form to clearly indicate a "Staff Approved" or "Commission Approved" application.

RECOMMENDATION

Historic Preservation staff recommends the Commission approve the proposed checklist to be completed, by the applicant(s) with Historic Preservation staff, for all Certificate of Appropriateness applications to be scheduled for Public Hearing before the Historic Preservation Commission.

Chairman Shope called on the commissioners for comments.

Vice Chairman Derr said he thought the previous case package looked great but the black & white photographs are required of any elevation altered for future work and owners. Chairman Shope asked David Klempin if he disagreed with the Vice Chairman's request; Mr. Klempin said no, he would provide photographs for future cases. Alternate Commissioner Eric Gilliland stated to have all information complete would be a huge aid to the commission. Commissioner Ashley Anderson asked what changes had been asked for; it was noted the minutes from the last meeting were included in the current agenda packet. Chairman Shope called on staff member Mary Bush to read aloud from the January 25, 2017 minutes the requests from the last meeting:

Chairman Shope asked if this form had been discussed with the Township's frequent users, Mr. Klempin answered yes, he had discussed with contractors Neal Cooper and Dave Smith who were good with it. Chairman Shope noted he had concerns, Ashley Anderson advised to be cognizant of people finding it difficult; Ted Ware advised if people will come with all the information needed, there will be no problem. Margaret Telford said she appreciated the form as she had seen applicants have to return to the following month's meeting due to lack of information needed by the Commission to review and make a decision. Chairman Shope agreed good communication would offer good choices, he asked staff to update the language and bring it back to the next meeting. January 25, 2017 HPC Minutes, IV. Public Hearing, Item B. Filing Requirements and Procedures, page 4.

Grapevine City Attorney Matthew Boyle approached the podium to sum up the group's concerns and questions:

- 1) with a box number seven (7) to be added to the checklist requiring black and white photographs of existing elevations of any building or structure to be altered or demolished;
- 2) the wording "is recommended" added to item number three at the bottom of the page; and
- 3) the original application's page two (2) of the four page document, have a box denoting approvals as "staff approved" or an "approval made in public hearing by the commission".

Ashley Anderson made the motion to close the public hearing for #CA17-07; Margaret Telford seconded the motion which prevailed in the following vote:

Ayes: 7 (Shope, Derr, Anderson, Gilliland, Telford, Voelker and Ware)

Absent: 1 (Cox)

Nays: None

Chairman Shope called for any other comments; there were none.

Ashley Anderson made the motion to approve **#CA17-07** with the conditions as presented for the photographs, the words "is recommended" and the box noting if staff approved or commission approved; Margaret Telford seconded the motion which prevailed in the following vote:

Ayes: 7 (Shope, Derr, Anderson, Gilliland, Telford, Voelker and Ware)

Absent: 1 (Cox) Nays: None

MINUTES

Chairman Shope called for the approval of the January 25, 2017 minutes. Commissioner Margaret Telford asked the last name of Chuck Voelker be corrected on pages 3 and 6.

Margaret Telford made the motion to approve the minutes of the January 25, 2017 meeting as amended above; Eric Gilliland seconded the motion which prevailed in the following vote:

Ayes: 7 (Shope, Derr, Anderson, Gilliland, Telford, Voelker and Ware)

Absent: 1 (Cox) Nays: None

ADJOURNMENT

Ted Ware made the motion to adjourn the meeting. Chuck Voelker seconded the motion, which prevailed in the following vote:

Ayes: 7 (Shope, Derr, Anderson, Gilliland, Telford, Voelker and Ware)

Absent: 1 (Cox) Nays: None

The meeting adjourned at 6:45p.m.

PASSED AND APPROVED BY THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF GRAPEVINE, TEXAS, ON THIS THE 22 DAY OF MARCH 2017.

APPROVED:

CHAIRMAN

ATTEST: